

ATTACHMENT TO MOTION TO INTERVENE

Case No. 2:20-cv-3657

**Proposed Motion to Dismiss of the State ex rel Wilson and the Department of
Administration**

DEFENDERS OF WILDLIFE,)	No.: 2:20-cv-3657-BHH
)	
Plaintiff,)	
)	
v.)	
)	
U.S. FISH AND WILDLIFE SERVICE,)	MOTION TO DISMISS
)	OF
Defendant.)	STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA, EX
)	REL ALAN WILSON,
And)	ATTORNEY GENERAL
)	AND SOUTH CAROLINA
CHARLES RIVER LABORATORIES)	DEPARTMENT OF
INTERNATIONAL, INC., STATE OF)	ADMINISTRATION
SOUTH CAROLINA, EX REL ALAN)	
WILSON, ATTORNEY GENERAL, AND)	
SOUTH CAROLINA DEPARTMENT OF)	
ADMINISTRATION,)	
)	
Intervenors-Defendants,)	

The Intervenors-Defendants State of South Carolina ex rel Alan Wilson, Attorney General, and the South Carolina Department of Administration, as named herein, hereby move for dismissal of the Complaint in this case pursuant to Rules 12(b)(1) and (6), FRCP, in that, for the reasons set forth below, this Court lacks subject matter jurisdiction of this case, and Plaintiff has failed to state a claim upon which relief can be granted:

1. This matter is controlled by the lease attached to the Complaint between the State and the Defendant United States Fish and Wildlife Service , and Plaintiff has no standing to challenge it. ECF 1-1. The lease states in part that it is “[s]ubject to . . . the right of the State of South Carolina to authorize the taking of shellfish, finfish and other salt water species within the refuge boundary.”

Under the lease, the State of South Carolina controls harvesting of horseshoe crabs within the Refuge covered by the lease.

2. This case presents no case or controversy or justiciable controversy given that this matter is controlled by the lease. The control of this matter by the lease and the interests of the State in point 3, *infra*, make this case a matter of State sovereignty which is beyond the jurisdiction of the Federal Courts.
3. The State's sovereign interests include its title to lands lying between the mean high water mark and mean low water mark which is held by the State in trust for public purposes absent a grant from the State or the King of England. *See Hobonny Club v. McEachern*, 272 S.C. 392, 252 S.E. 2d 133 (1979). Also, under S.C. Const. art. XIV, § 4, the State's waterways are public highways.
4. These intervenors reserve the right to assert other provisions of State and Federal law in support of dismissal.

ALAN WILSON
Attorney General
Federal ID No.10457

ROBERT D. COOK
Solicitor General
Federal ID No. 285
Email: rcook@scag.gov

/s/ J. Emory Smith, Jr.
J. EMORY SMITH, JR.
Deputy Solicitor General
Federal ID No. 3908
Email: esmith@scag.gov

[Signature block continues next page]

Office of the Attorney General
Post Office Box 11549
Columbia, South Carolina 29211
Phone: (803) 734-3680
Fax: (803) 734-3677

April 22, 2021

Counsel for the State ex rel Wilson and
the Department of Administration